

**BOARD OF CIVIL AUTHORITY MEETING MINUTES**  
**AUGUST 29, 2013**  
**RANDOLPH TOWN HALL**  
**CONFERENCE ROOM B**  
**6:30 P.M.**

**Board Members Present:** Ruth Lutz, Barbara Angell, Martha Lawrence, Richard Burstein, Jack Cowdrey, Ellen Baker, Larry Richburg, Marjorie Ryerson, Joyce Mazzucco  
**Others:** Patrick French, Town Assessor; Don Sweester, Lister; Mimi Burstein, Lister; Leo Connolly and Sheila Connolly

The Board of Civil Authority meeting was called to order by Board Chair Richard Burstein at 6:44 p.m. Since the meeting was called to order early and the party that is appealing their tax assessment value was not present yet, the Board proceeded with reviewing the list of names of voters who will be sent challenge letters. Town Clerk Joyce Mazzucco distributed copies of a list of names she had compiled from the other lists that the board members had previously turned in. The Board discussed some of the names on the list and some names were deleted from the list. Jack Cowdrey made a motion to approve the amended list of names to send challenge letters. Marjorie Ryerson seconded the motion. A voice vote was taken and the motion carried by majority vote. The following is the list of voters to be sent challenge letters before the September 15<sup>th</sup> deadline:

Raymond D. Adams	Matthew J. Aiello	Steven M. Albert
Gabriel R. Allen	Joseph O. Angell	James B. Angell
Vincent Edward Arbuiso	Heath Bruorton Arnold	Simone A. Arnold
Nathan C. Bacon	Asa J. F. Baer	Monica M. Barker
Peter J. Baumann	Hannah E. Becker	Elizabeth A. Benoir
Megan R. Benoit	Daniel P. Benson	Michael J. Berry
Richard D. Bestenbostel	Erin M. Blosser	Ginger E. Boardman
Ryan A. Boardman	Daniel J. Bohnyak	Matthew C. Bortz
Joshua R. Bourdeau	Gerald J. Boutot, Jr.	Suzanne M. Boutot
Amanda Ann Bowen	Bonnie M. Bridge	Donald S. Brockett
Robin C. Brockett	Shelley B. Brockett	Austin E. Brooks
Kenneth E. Brown	Lindsay Nicole Browning	John Patrick Burke
Brittney L. Calsbeek	Alan S. Campbell	Ann M. Campbell
Robert P. Caouette	Jordin E. Carpenter	Gary J. Champy
Tara P. Champy	Arnold B. Chase	Elaine M. Chase
Dawn F. Chittenden	John R. Chittenden	James M. Christensen
Michael D. Ciampi	Randy S. Clark	Sheila M. Clark
Carrie A. Clement	Shaw Clement	George Edward Cloutier
Alex M. Coache	Lindsay A. Cochran	Casie M. Cohn
Sabrina M. Colson	Seth A. Companion	Kayleen M. Cooper
Billie J. Cormier	Dustin W. Cressman	Constance C. Crouse
Elizabeth L. Crowe	Paul T. Cundari	Eleanor Mary Carrier
Carlos G. Dorrien	Florence Eells	Arleen A. Fortune
Stephen L. Foss	Kimberly Francis	Benjamin Fratkin
Joan L. Frey	Claire E. Garner	James B. Goodall
Kristen A. Greene	Wayne E. Greene	April M. Greenway
Rena R. HaEVERS	Colin R. Hagan	Faith D. Hardy

Mitchell T. Harness	Molly K. Harness	Zachary E. Heaton
Kirsten A. Heiman	Krista M. Heidelmeier	Lawrence Irish, Jr.
Amie E. Kennedy	Jessica E. Knapp	Marie I. Kurutza
Phillip L. Lease	Kyle T. Major	L. Forest Maletesta-Cundari
Stephen M. Manchester	Jessica M. Martin	Sara M. Mayotte
Alex M. McGregor	Joanne R. Meginnes	Wayne D. Meginnes
Ben B. Merrill	Chad A. Miller	Shelly J. Miller-LaValley
Nathan A. Montgomery	Benjamin D. Murphy-Smith	Mark R. Murray
Ngoc-Lan T. Nguyen-Knoff	Jonathan E. Nieto	Audrey N. Pease
John C. Pease	Stephanie R. Perkins	Deborah Price
Matthew G. Price	Jeffrey S. Pynduss	Jennifer M. Pynduss
Hannah M. Roberts	Siobhan Robinson	Garrett S. Rockwell
Derek Salomon	Mardee A. Sanchez	Chad M. Sargent
Mary E. Sargent	Stephen H. Schillinger	Jane W. Seymour
Matthew S. Shumway	Shayne C. Solomon	Katherine A. Soules
Marlene D. Sutherin	Lauri A. Sybel	Randall T. Sybel
Shaun M. Taft	Trevor O. Talon	Edna A. Tipton
Herbert R. Tipton	Marilyn J. Truesdale	Alex B. Wilson
Cynthia B. Wilson	George A. Wilson	Linda A. Winot
Robert A. Wolffe	James D. Wright	Melissa I. Wright
Dwain A. Young		

Board Chair Mr. Burstein called the tax assessment appeal hearing to order at 6:56 p.m. upon the arrival of Leo and Sheila Connolly. The property under appeal is a single family dwelling on 5 acres located at 475 Fish Hill Road and is owned by Leo and Sheila Connolly, parcel #118039-000. Mr. Burstein asked if any board members needed to recuse themselves from hearing this appeal. The following board members recused themselves from taking action on this appeal: Marjorie Ryerson, Ellen Baker and Jack Cowdrey. Mr. Burstein will abstain from voting on the appeal.

Town Clerk Joyce Mazzucco administered the following oath to the board members: “I solemnly swear (or affirm) that I will well and truly hear and determine all matters at issue between taxpayers and listers submitted for my decision. So help me God (or under the pains and penalties of perjury).” Ms. Mazzucco circulated an oath sheet for the board members who took the oath to sign. She then gave the following oath to Leo Connolly and Patrick French: “Do you solemnly swear (or affirm) that the evidence you shall give relative to the cause now under consideration shall be the whole truth and nothing but the truth so help you God (or under the pains and penalties of perjury)?”

The Connollys’ appeal letter, dated August 7, 2013, was labeled as “Exhibit 1”. Mr. Burstein asked Mr. Connolly to present his evidence. Mr. Connolly told the Board he and his wife bought the property last year for \$299,000.00. The bank appraisal of the property, dated 04/20/2012, indicated a value of \$310,000.00. Mr. Connolly entered a copy of the bank appraisal as evidence and this was labeled as “Exhibit 2”. Mr. Connolly also provided copies of printouts from **Zillow**, an online real estate database, on two properties he thought were comparable to his property. The first printout was on a property located at 1256 Fish Hill Road, and this was entered into evidence and labeled as “Exhibit 3”. The 1256 Fish Hill Road property has a listing price of \$298,500.00. It is a single family dwelling, 2,200 square feet, 3 bedrooms, 2 ½ bathrooms, on 10.13 acres and was built in 1988. The second printout was on a property located at 527 Partridge Hill Road, and this was entered into evidence and labeled as “Exhibit 4”.

The 527 Partridge Hill Road property sold on 08/15/2011 for \$232,000.00. It is a single family dwelling, 2,556 square feet, 4 bedrooms, 2 baths, on 1.43 acres and was built in 1990. A discussion followed with the following individuals participating in the discussion: Richard Burstein, Leo Connolly, Barbara Angell, Martha Lawrence, Jack Cowdrey, Patrick French, and Ruth Lutz. The discussion touched on who hired the appraiser (Wells Fargo Bank), an additional deck (was not included in the Lister's diagram of the dwelling), proper building permits, a whole house fan (installed by the Connollys) and the assessed value from the 2006 reappraisal (\$327,300.00). Mr. Connolly indicated that he is looking to have the tax assessment value lowered to a number between \$299,000 and \$310,000.

Patrick French, Town Assessor presented information on behalf of the Listers. He entered into evidence a memo to the Board, which was labeled as "Exhibit A", and three (3) color photographs of the subject property, which was labeled as "Exhibit B". Mr. French told the Board that he had a couple discussions with Mr. Connolly about the property and the Listers looked at the property in the late spring. The Listers made three (3) changes that affected the tax assessment value. There was additional depreciation added, additional value for the deck and additional value for the whole house fan, resulting in an increase in value from \$327,000.00 to \$328,400.00. Mr. French stated that the appeal is based on the price paid and the appraisal value. Since this was a direct sale, the Connollys saved on the commission. If this property had been purchased through a broker, the sales price would likely have been in the \$320,000.00 range. A discussion followed with the following individuals participating in the discussion: Patrick French, Richard Burstein, Leo Connolly, and Barbara Angell. An appraisal is an estimate of value and it is not uncommon for appraisers to offer an opinion of value that may vary by 5-10% above or below the town assessment. The difference between the Connollys' bank appraisal and the town assessment is 5.6%. If there is a variation more than 7% it usually indicates a problem. Mr. French stated the best comparable property to the subject property is 202 Lefebvre Road, after adjusting for location and quality of construction. There is never a large market in Randolph for higher valued properties. It usually takes longer to sell. Mr. French commented on the two comparables submitted into evidence by Mr. Connolly. There were no adjustments made for any differences between the properties. He also pointed out that one of the comparable properties was a property that is still for sale. Mr. French stated that when using comparables you compare information on other properties that have sold. Mr. Connolly stated he is looking to have the tax assessment value lowered to \$304,500.00.

There was no further discussion. An Inspection Committee was appointed. The following board members will serve on the Inspection Committee: Barbara Angell, Ruth Lutz and Larry Richburg. The inspection of the property will take place on Monday, September 9, 2013 at 11:30 a.m. The next meeting of the Board of Civil Authority will be on Thursday, September 26, 2013.

There was no further business to consider. Ruth Lutz made a motion to adjourn the meeting. Jack Cowdrey seconded the motion. A voice vote was taken and the meeting adjourned at 7:40 p.m.

Attest: \_\_\_\_\_  
Joyce L. Mazzucco, Town Clerk